

**EXHIBIT 1 TO
DECLARATION OF CARLA D. BROWN**

SUMMARY OF TIME RECORDS FOR WHICH AN AWARD IS REQUESTED

Elaine Charlson Bredehoft, Principal Attorney 131.8 hours @ \$550 and 19.3 hours @ \$600 (N/C 7.0 @ \$550 and 0.3 @ \$600)	\$ 188,290.00
Carla D. Brown, Principal Attorney 1,099 hours @ \$475 per hour (N/C 33.8)	\$ 522,025.00
Brian A. Scotti, Trial Counsel/Associates 449.4 hours @ 425 per hour (N/C 31.1)	\$ 190,995.00
Heather A. Jones, Senior Associate 30.4 hours @ 450 per hour	\$ 13,680.00
Kathleen Z. Quill, Senior Associate/Special Projects 27.6 hours @ 400 per hour	\$ 11,040.00
Daphne S. Gebauer, Associate 59.6 hours @ \$375 and 55.4 hours @ \$400 (N/C 11.3 @ 400 per hour)	\$ 44,510.00
Aseil Abu-Baker, Associate 44.0 hours @ 325 per hour (N/C 0.6)	\$ 14,300.00
Leslie A. Hoff, Senior Paralegal 411.7 hours @ 250 per hour (N/C 21.5)	\$ 102,925.00
Kathy McBride Baker, Senior Paralegal 44.3 hours @ \$250 per hour (N/C 0.8)	\$ 11,075.00
Alexandra C. Bredehoft, Paralegal 107.9 hours @ \$135 per hour	\$ 14,566.50
Abbas A. Sabur, Paralegal 42.5 hours @ \$135per hour	\$ 5,737.50

TOTAL BILLABLE FEES: \$ 1,119,144.00

**EXHIBIT 2 TO
DECLARATION OF CARLA D. BROWN**

SUMMARY OF "NO CHARGE" BY TIMEKEEPER

Elaine Charlson Bredehoft	7.0 @ 550 0.3 @ 600	\$ 3,850.00 \$ 180.00
Carla D. Brown	33.8 @475	\$ 16,055.00
Brian A. Scotti	31.1 @ 425	\$ 13,217.50
Daphne Shih Gebauer	11.3 @ 400	\$ 4,520.00
Aseil Abu-Baker	0.6 @ 325	\$ 195.00
Leslie A. Hoff	21.5 @ 250	\$ 5,375.00
Kathy M. Baker	0.5 @ 250	\$ 125.00

TOTAL NO CHARGE: \$43,517.50

SUMMARY OF TIMEKEEPERS REMOVED

Peter C. Cohen, Principal Attorney	3.0 hours @ 500 per hour	\$ 1,500.00
Brittany J. Sakata, Principal Attorney	.7 hours @ \$450 per hour	\$ 315.00
Monique A. Miles, Associate:	14.2 hours @ \$375 per hour	\$ 5,325.00
Erin J. Kelly, Associate	17.8 hours @ \$300 per hour	\$ 5,340.00
Nick Dilenschneider, Law Clerk	6.3 hours @ \$275 per hour	\$ 1,732.50
Michelle C. Bredehoft, Paralegal	6.6 hours @ \$135 per hour	\$ 891.00

TOTAL OF TIMEKEEPERS REMOVED: \$15,103.50

TOTAL NO CHARGE + TIMEKEEPERS REMOVED: \$ 58,621.00

EXHIBIT 3 TO DECLARATION OF CARLA D. BROWN

<i>Attorney</i>	<i>Experience</i>	<i>Actual Rate</i>	<i>Laffey¹</i>	<i>Laffey Adjusted²</i>	<i>No Va Rate³</i>
Elaine C. Bredehopt	29 years	\$550-600	\$495 / \$505	\$734 / \$753 / \$771	\$505-820
Carla D. Brown	14 years	\$475	\$435 / \$445	\$609 / \$625 / \$640	\$520-770
Brian A. Scotti	9 years	\$425	\$350 / \$355	\$540 / \$554 / \$567	\$465-640
Heather A. Jones	11 years	\$450	\$435 / \$445	\$609 / \$625 / \$640	\$520-770
Kathleen Z. Quill	17 years	\$400	\$435 / \$445	\$609 / \$625 / \$640	\$520-770
Daphne S. Gebauer	6 years	\$375-400	\$285 / \$290	\$374 / \$383 / \$393	\$350-600
Aseil Abu-Baker	3 years	\$325	\$240 / \$245	\$305 / \$312 / \$320	\$250-\$415
PARALEGALS					
Kathy M. Baker	30 years	\$250	\$145 / \$145	\$166 / \$170 / \$175	\$130-350
Leslie A. Hoff	23 years	\$250	\$145 / \$145	\$166 / \$170 / \$175	\$130-350
Alexandra C. Bredehopt	1 year	\$135	\$145 / \$145	\$166 / \$170 / \$175	\$130-350
Abbas A. Sabur	1 year	\$135	\$145 / \$145	\$166 / \$170 / \$175	\$130-350

¹ 2011-12 rate / 2012-13 rate

² June 1, 2011-May 31 2012 rate / June 1, 2012 – May 31, 2013 rate / June 1, 2013 – May 1, 2014 rate

³ Source: Craig Reilly survey of Northern Virginia rates, 2011, referenced by this Court in *Vienna Metro LLC v. Pulte Home Corp.*, No. 1:10cv502 (GBL) (E.D. Va. Aug. 24, 2011) and *Tech Systems, Inc. v. Lovelen Pyles, et al.*, No. 12cv00374-GBL (JFA) (E.D. Va. Aug. 6, 2013).

**LAFFEY MATRIX -- 2003-2013
(2009-10 rates were unchanged from 2008-09 rates)**

Experience	Years (Rate for June 1 - May 31, based on prior year's CPI-U)									
	03-04	04-05	05-06	06-07	07-08	08-09	09-10	10-11	11-12	12-13
20+ years	380	390	405	425	440	465	465	475	495	505
11-19 years	335	345	360	375	390	410	410	420	435	445
8-10 years	270	280	290	305	315	330	330	335	350	355
4-7 years	220	225	235	245	255	270	270	275	285	290
1-3 years	180	185	195	205	215	225	225	230	240	245
Paralegals & Law Clerks	105	110	115	120	125	130	130	135	140	145

Explanatory Notes:

1. This matrix of hourly rates for attorneys of varying experience levels and paralegals/law clerks has been prepared by the Civil Division of the United States Attorney's Office for the District of Columbia. The matrix is intended to be used in cases in which a "fee-shifting" statute permits the prevailing party to recover "reasonable" attorney's fees. *See, e.g.*, 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-5(k) (Title VII of the 1964 Civil Rights Act); 5 U.S.C. § 552(a)(4)(E) (Freedom of Information Act); 28 U.S.C. § 2412 (b) (Equal Access to Justice Act). The matrix does **not** apply in cases in which the hourly rate is limited by statute. *See* 28 U.S.C. § 2412(d).
2. This matrix is based on the hourly rates allowed by the District Court in *Laffey v. Northwest Airlines, Inc.*, 572 F. Supp. 354 (D.D.C. 1983), *aff'd in part, rev'd in part on other grounds*, 746 F.2d 4 (D.C. Cir. 1984), *cert. denied*, 472 U.S. 1021 (1985). It is commonly referred to by attorneys and federal judges in the District of Columbia as the "*Laffey* Matrix" or the "United States Attorney's Office Matrix." The column headed "Experience" refers to the years following the attorney's graduation from law school. The various "brackets" are intended to correspond to "junior associates" (1-3 years after law school graduation), "senior associates" (4-7 years), "experienced federal court litigators" (8-10 and 11-19 years), and "very experienced federal court litigators" (20 years or more). *See Laffey*, 572 F. Supp. at 371.
3. The hourly rates approved by the District Court in *Laffey* were for work done principally in 1981-82. The Matrix begins with those rates. *See Laffey*, 572 F. Supp. at 371 (attorney rates) & 386 n.74 (paralegal and law clerk rate). The rates for subsequent yearly periods were determined by adding the change in the cost of living for the Washington, D.C. area to the applicable rate for the prior year, and then rounding to the nearest multiple of \$5 (up if within \$3 of the next multiple of \$5). The result is subject to adjustment if appropriate to ensure that the relationship between the highest rate and the lower rates remains reasonably constant. Changes in the cost of living are measured by the Consumer Price Index for All Urban Consumers (CPI-U) for Washington-Baltimore, DC-MD-VA-WV, as announced by the Bureau of Labor Statistics for May of each year.
4. Use of an updated *Laffey* Matrix was implicitly endorsed by the Court of Appeals in *Save Our Cumberland Mountains v. Hodel*, 857 F.2d 1516, 1525 (D.C. Cir. 1988) (en banc). The Court of Appeals subsequently stated that parties may rely on the updated *Laffey* Matrix prepared by the United States Attorney's Office as evidence of prevailing market rates for litigation counsel in the Washington, D.C. area. *See Covington v. District of Columbia*, 57 F.3d 1101, 1105 & n. 14, 1109 (D.C. Cir. 1995), *cert. denied*, 516 U.S. 1115 (1996). Lower federal courts in the District of Columbia have used this updated *Laffey* Matrix when determining whether fee awards under fee-shifting statutes are reasonable. *See, e.g.*, *Blackman v. District of Columbia*, 59 F. Supp. 2d 37, 43 (D.D.C. 1999); *Jefferson v. Milvets System Technology, Inc.*, 986 F. Supp. 6, 11 (D.D.C. 1997); *Ralph Hoar & Associates v. Nat'l Highway Transportation Safety Admin.*, 985 F. Supp. 1, 9-10 n.3 (D.D.C. 1997); *Martini v. Fed. Nat'l Mtg Ass'n*, 977 F. Supp. 482, 485 n.2 (D.D.C. 1997); *Park v. Howard University*, 881 F. Supp. 653, 654 (D.D.C. 1995).

LAFFEY MATRIX

History

Case Law

Expert Opinion

See the Matrix

Contact us

Home

Links

Year	Adjustmt Factor**	Paralegal/ Law Clerk	Years Out of Law School *				
			1-3	4-7	8-10	11-19	20 +
6/01/13- 5/31/14	1.0244	\$175	\$320	\$393	\$567	\$640	\$771
6/01/12- 5/31/13	1.0258	\$170	\$312	\$383	\$554	\$625	\$753
6/01/11- 5/31/12	1.0352	\$166	\$305	\$374	\$540	\$609	\$734
6/01/10- 5/31/11	1.0337	\$161	\$294	\$361	\$522	\$589	\$709
6/01/09- 5/31/10	1.0220	\$155	\$285	\$349	\$505	\$569	\$686
6/01/08- 5/31/09	1.0399	\$152	\$279	\$342	\$494	\$557	\$671
6/01/07-5/31/08	1.0516	\$146	\$268	\$329	\$475	\$536	\$645
6/01/06-5/31/07	1.0256	\$139	\$255	\$313	\$452	\$509	\$614
6/1/05- 5/31/06	1.0427	\$136	\$249	\$305	\$441	\$497	\$598
6/1/04- 5/31/05	1.0455	\$130	\$239	\$293	\$423	\$476	\$574
6/1/03- 6/1/04	1.0507	\$124	\$228	\$280	\$405	\$456	\$549
6/1/02- 5/31/03	1.0727	\$118	\$217	\$267	\$385	\$434	\$522
6/1/01- 5/31/02	1.0407	\$110	\$203	\$249	\$359	\$404	\$487
6/1/00- 5/31/01	1.0529	\$106	\$195	\$239	\$345	\$388	\$468
6/1/99- 5/31/00	1.0491	\$101	\$185	\$227	\$328	\$369	\$444
6/1/98- 5/31/99	1.0439	\$96	\$176	\$216	\$312	\$352	\$424
6/1/97- 5/31/98	1.0419	\$92	\$169	\$207	\$299	\$337	\$406
6/1/96- 5/31/97	1.0396	\$88	\$162	\$198	\$287	\$323	\$389
6/1/95- 5/31/96	1.032	\$85	\$155	\$191	\$276	\$311	\$375

6/1/94- 5/31/95	1.0237	\$82	\$151	\$185	\$267	\$301	\$363
--------------------	--------	------	-------	-------	-------	-------	-------

The methodology of calculation and benchmarking for this Updated Laffey Matrix has been approved in a number of cases. See, e.g., *McDowell v. District of Columbia*, Civ. A. No. 00-594 (RCL), LEXSEE 2001 U.S. Dist. LEXIS 8114 (D.D.C. June 4, 2001); *Salazar v. Dist. of Col.*, 123 F.Supp.2d 8 (D.D.C. 2000).

* "Years Out of Law School" is calculated from June 1 of each year, when most law students graduate. "1-3" includes an attorney in his 1st, 2nd and 3rd years of practice, measured from date of graduation (June 1). "4-7" applies to attorneys in their 4th, 5th, 6th and 7th years of practice. An attorney who graduated in May 1996 would be in tier "1-3" from June 1, 1996 until May 31, 1999, would move into tier "4-7" on June 1, 1999, and tier "8-10" on June 1, 2003.

** The Adjustment Factor refers to the nation-wide Legal Services Component of the Consumer Price Index produced by the Bureau of Labor Statistics of the United States Department of Labor.

*EXHIBIT 6 TO
DECLARATION OF CARLA D. BROWN*

SUMMARY OF NON-TAXABLE COSTS

Copying:	\$ 9,440.50
Expert Witness Fees of Bill Foote/Aronson LLC:	\$ 16,709.00
Facsimile:	\$ 22.00
Federal Express:	\$ 334.96
Local Travel & Parking	\$ 1,183.59
Messenger Service:	\$ 2,195.03
Postage:	\$ 68.67
Private Process Server Fees:	\$ 360.00
Telephone Expenses:	\$ 17.35
Lexis/Accurint/Legal Research):	\$ 2,923.51
Videographers Services (Depositions of Jennifer Taylor, Ronald Krall, Jason Callaway)	\$ 2,022.50
Expert Witness Fees and Services:	\$ 67,746.50
William Foote (Aronson LLC)	\$ 16,709.00
Ryan Shugarman, M.D.	\$ 19,300.00
iDiscovery Solutions (Julian Ackert)	\$ 28,762.50
Liza H. Gold, M.D. (Defs' Expert)	\$ 2,000.00
Kristin Kucsma (Defs' Expert)	\$ 975.00

NON-TAXABLE COSTS TOTAL: \$ 103,023.61